

# **Suzuki Piano Method**

## **Reconciliation of Published Editions, Book 2**

**Written by Cathy Williams Hargrave**  
**Rowlett, Texas, USA**

**Compiled by Christine Mathews**

**Web Edited by Kenneth Wilburn**  
**Greenville, NC, USA**

**©2003**

---

### **Dr. Haruko Kataoka**

Dr. Haruko Kataoka is the co-founder of the Suzuki Piano Method. Born in Tokyo in 1927, she began the study of piano at the age of six with the late Yoshimune Hirata. Graduating from Sacred Heart Girls' High School in Tokyo in 1945, she continued piano studies with Haruko Fujita. Dr. Kataoka moved to Matsumoto City in 1955 to serve as accompanist in Dr. Shinichi Suzuki's Talent Education Institute, where she began to research piano pedagogy based upon Dr. Suzuki's methods of teaching violin. Thereafter, having developed the repertoire for the Suzuki Piano Method, she has served as Director of the Piano Department at the Talent Education Research Institute in Matsumoto, where she continues to teach students and to train teachers from Japan and from around the world. For over a decade, she has directed "Ten Piano Concerts" in Matsumoto every 18 months, which have become international events since 1993, with the inclusion of students from other countries.

Beginning in 1972, when she attended the Suzuki Institute at Stevens Point, Wisconsin as a teacher trainer, Dr. Kataoka has traveled abroad for several weeks each year to conduct international workshops at universities and other centers in North America, Europe and Australia as well as in Japan and other Asian countries. Dr. Kataoka was awarded the Matsumoto City Arts and Culture Award in 1986 and was granted an honorary doctorate in music from the University of Louisville, Louisville, Kentucky in 1990.

Dr. Kataoka's publications in English include *My Thoughts on the Suzuki Piano School* (Birch Tree Group, Ltd., 1985), *My Thoughts on Piano Technique* (Birch Tree Group, Ltd., 1988) and *Sensibility and Education* (Piano Basics, Inc., 1993).

---

### **Introduction**

In the *Suzuki Piano Method*, we now have several different editions of the repertoire and the sequence in which it is to be presented. The repertoire and sequence were originally decided upon by three teachers, Dr. Shinichi Suzuki, Dr. Haruko Kataoka, and Mrs. Shizuko Suzuki.

Naturally, everyone knows Dr. Shinichi Suzuki was the genius behind the creation of the Suzuki Philosophy and the *Suzuki Violin Method*. However, not everyone knows what role Dr. Suzuki, Dr. Kataoka, and Mrs. Shizuko Suzuki played in the formation of the *Suzuki Piano Method*. A clear understanding of the editions of the Suzuki repertoire is not possible without this information.

Mrs. Shizuko Suzuki was Dr. Suzuki's sister-in-law. When Dr. Suzuki first had the idea to adapt the *Suzuki Violin Method* to the piano, Mrs. Suzuki, a pianist, was the logical choice. Until Dr. Suzuki's death, Mrs. Suzuki's teaching was directly based upon his advice about piano teaching and technique. She did not claim to be the type of teacher who researches ideas and often deferred to Dr. Kataoka at conferences and teaching sessions when such topics arose (as witnessed by this author).

Dr. Kataoka's first exposure to the Suzuki Method began as an accompanist for Dr. Suzuki's violin students. For ten years she carefully observed Dr. Suzuki's teaching and researched ideas for the same type of piano methodology. Eventually, she formed a class of students and became the teacher-trainer at Dr. Suzuki's school, The Talent Education Institute, in Matsumoto. She continues teaching with a researching spirit and has helped teachers all over the world become better teachers and pianists.

The first edition of the *Suzuki Piano Method* was published in Japan by Zen-On. A few years later Summy-Birchard obtained all publishing rights for every country outside Japan. The most recent editions for countries outside of Japan are published by Warner Brothers.

Each edition has its own problems and discrepancies. The biggest problem is in regard to fingerings; however, all three editions have mistakes in other areas as well. As a result, Suzuki piano teachers are more confused than ever. This problem is the most obvious during workshops. Clinicians see so many different fingerings now that it is impossible to know whether the student is playing correctly or not. Fingerings for the beginner and intermediate level student are not a matter of personal taste; yet, teachers and students have become quite creative with fingering selections and beginners are not always learning basic fingering patterns.

The purpose of this new column will be to discuss some differences in these editions from a pedagogical standpoint and especially to clarify what fingering Dr. Kataoka teaches in these pieces. The column will begin with Volume I and progress through Volume 7. Whenever possible, especially for the upper-level books, facsimiles of original manuscripts and reliable Urtext editions will be consulted.

Note: This series of articles uses the *Sol-Fa* system with a Fixed *Do* for naming notes. This means that in any key signature, "C" is always *Do*. *Sol-Fa* and *Solfège* are not the same systems, although they are similar. Unlike *Solfège*, the addition of accidentals in the *Sol-Fa* system does not change the note's name. For example, when singing a note with an accidental, the pitch will change but the word "sharp" or "flat" would not be sung. However, when verbally discussing the names of notes, the word "sharp" or "flat" is used. Americans do not learn this system but many other countries do. It is very simple and children do not become confused.

---

## Comparison of Editions

There is a great deal of confusion among teachers, students, and parents due to the various editions in print at this time. Suzuki Piano Basics teachers wish to continue following the fingerings and phrasing of Dr. Haruko Kataoka, the co-founder of the *Suzuki Piano School*. Dr. Kataoka still actively teaches

children and teachers in Japan as well as in the United States. The other co-founders were Dr. Suzuki and Mrs. Shizuko Suzuki, his sister-in-law.

The editions being compared are:

1. the original Japanese edition published by Zen-On Gakufu
2. the American edition published by Summy-Birchard Inc., and
3. the most recent edition, The Revised edition, published by Summy Birchard International and distributed by Warner Brothers (referred to below as the W.B. edition).

Since the Summy-Birchard Inc. edition is basically a re-print of the Zen-On edition, the comparison will be between the Zen-On edition and the Revised edition. The Zen-On editions are sold only in Japan through the Talent Education Institute and its designated offices. Most of the fingerings found in the Zen-On edition are the ones taught by Dr. Haruko Kataoka.

Teachers, students, and parents living outside Japan may only purchase the Revised edition (W.B. edition). This edition has some improvements upon the other editions but one disadvantage is the fact that many fingerings found in the Zen-On edition have been changed. Most of the fingerings Dr. Kataoka teaches can be found in the Zen-On edition; however, some of her fingerings are not printed in any edition.

The Zen-On edition has Dr. Suzuki's written explanation of the general principles of the philosophy, listening, tonalization, daily practice, memorization, review, reading, developing musicianship, and observation. The W. B. Edition has an introduction for parents and teachers stressing the importance of on-going training in the Suzuki Method for teachers. This is a welcome suggestion for continuing to raise our standards for the future. It would be wonderful to have a preface including these parts of both editions under one cover.

Next, each edition contains a page introducing a C (*Do*) Major Scale. The Zen-On edition also has a *Preparatory Grace Note Study*. Dr. Kataoka does not assign introductory exercises before pieces; however, a scale routine is started when a student begins Volume 2, and the technique for playing grace notes is studied in *Ecossaise*. (For detailed information on this topic, Dr. Kataoka's books, *How To Teach Beginners* and *The Method of Training Beginners* may be purchased from the Suzuki Piano Basics Foundation.)

Web editor's note: the online edition of *How To Teach Beginners* is located at

<http://core.ecu.edu/hist/wilburnk/SuzukiPianoBasics/KataokaSensei/HTB.htm>

---

***Ecossaise***  
by J.N. Hummel

In the Zen-On edition, Measures 1-4 of the Right Hand are completely *legato*, not breaking the slur at the end of Measure 3 as printed in the W.B. edition.

In Zen-On, the fingering of the Left Hand on the 2nd beat of Measure 3 is the fingering Piano Basics teachers follow. This would place finger 2 on *Re* (so the thumb is free to play the top note of the next chord in Measure 4) and finger 5 on *Sol*. This is a better choice than using the thumb three times in a row as in the W.B. edition.

There is slight difference between the editions in the Left Hand rhythm of Measure 4. Zen-On has a quarter note tied to an eighth note and W.B. has a quarter note followed by a quarter rest. This difference is inconsequential.

Zen-On also has the last note of the phrase in each hand marked *staccato* in Measure 8 and W.B. has them marked as quarter notes with no *staccato*. In this case, W.B. is the one we teach.

The Right Hand phrasing of Measure 17-18 of W.B. has the slur carried across the bar line rather than breaking the *legato* after the eighth note of the 2nd beat of Measure 17. Again W.B. is the one to follow. In Measure 19-20, the Right Hand *legato* should also be carried across the bar line.

---

### ***A Short Story***

by H. Lichner

Both Zen-On and W.B. have a slur over four notes of the *Alberti Bass* accompaniment patterns; however, Dr. Kataoka does not break the *legato* after every group.

W.B. has the 3rd finger play *Mi* in the Right Hand of Measure 2 (not counting the pick-up measure) but Zen-On has this note played by the 2nd finger. Dr. Kataoka's students place the 2nd finger on *Mi*. Both editions agree that the Left Hand of Measures 9-16 have a slur over a group of eight eighth notes; however, Dr. Kataoka teaches one long phrase from Measure 9-12 and Measure 13-16. The *legato* is only broken at that point since the Left Hand has to leap from the Treble Clef to the Bass Clef.

In Measure 2 of the Right Hand, W.B. has *staccato* markings. Zen-On has quarter notes with no articulation marking. Dr. Kataoka very carefully teaches these notes *legato*.

The remainder of the piece is basically the same as the beginning.

---

### ***The Happy Farmer***

by Robert Schumann

Zen-On and W.B. have different fingerings for the Right Hand chords in the last half of Measure 1. Zen-On has fingers 1-2-4 playing *Fa - La - Do* but W.B. has 1-3-5. Dr. Kataoka teaches 1-2-4. Another difference between the two editions is in the Right Hand of Measure 4. W.B. has 1-4 (*Do - Sol*) but Dr. Kataoka teaches 1-3 as printed in Zen-On. The same fingerings apply in Measure 8.

In Measures 10, 12, 16 and 18. W.B. has a few Right Hand notes printed in parentheses. Zen On does not have these notes printed at all and Dr. Kataoka does not teach these notes.

In the Right Hand and Left Hand of Measure 10 and 16, both editions have the first eighth note of the measure slurred to the second. Dr. Kataoka teaches all the eighth notes on the first and second beat *staccato*.

There is also a difference between the two editions in the slur of the Left Hand of Measure 13-14 (including the pick-up note to Measure 13). Rather than play these notes with a break in the *legato* between beats 2 and 3 and beats 4 and 1, Dr. Kataoka only breaks the *legato* between measure 13-14 but teaches her students to make this break as inconspicuous as possible. The fingering she teaches in the Left Hand of Measure 14 is 5-1 (*Ti flat - Sol*), 4-2 (*Do - Mi*), 1 (*Fa*). Then, the three chords can be played *legato*. W.B. has the fingering of 5-1, 5-3, 2.

---

*Minuet 1*  
by Johann Sebastian Bach

Historically, the performance of Baroque music was highly improvisatory and indicative of the performer's artistic sense. This remains true today. Dr. Kataoka is well aware of Baroque performance practice and does not ignore it completely; however, she does not feel this is the most important concept to teach in depth to an early Volume 2 student. Rather than deal with developing a beginning level student's personal style, it is more appropriate to continue teaching a solid foundation and the basic principles of musical interpretation. Therefore, *Minuet 1* is taught without ornamentation, with very few detached notes, and the left hand is mostly *legato*.

Dr. Kataoka does teach detached tone between the octave intervals of the left hand in the following places:

- a) from the 3rd beat of measure 2 and the first beat of measure 3
- b) between beats 1, 2, and 3 of measure 4
- c) from the 3rd beat of measure 11 and the first beat of measure 12
- d) between beat 1 and 3 of measure 16
- e) between beat 1 and 2 of measure 17
- f) between beat 3 of measure 19 and beat 1 of measure 20
- g) between beat 1, 2, and 3 of measure 21
- h) between beat 1 and 3 of measure 24

She teaches detached tone in the right hand (but not *staccato*) in the following places:

- a) from beat 3 of measure 2 to beat 1 of measure 3 (because it is a phrase ending)
- b) from beat 3 of measure 11 to beat 1 of measure 12 (phrase ending)
- c) from beat 3 of measure 13 to beat 1 of measure 14 (phrase ending)
- d) from beat 3 of measure 19 to beat 1 of measure 20 (phrase ending)
- e) from beat 3 of measure 21 to beat 1 of measure 22 (phrase ending)

Another frequently asked question concerns the dotted half notes in the left hand in measure 2, 11, 13, and 19. These rhythms are indicated in all editions but Dr. Kataoka does not ask the student to hold the dotted half notes. Holding these notes may cause stiffness, tension, or hyperextension of a student's hand, so play them simply as quarter notes. We are more concerned with developing the skill of carefully hearing the exact length of individual notes, than refining the same skill to include hearing the length of different voices played simultaneously in one hand.

Fingering differences between the Zen-On edition and the W.B. edition are detailed below. If only the Zen-On edition and the W.B. edition are mentioned, the reader may assume Dr. Kataoka teaches the Zen-On edition fingerings.

Measure 12 - The Zen-On edition has 2-3-4 in the right hand and 2-1-2 in the left hand. The W.B. edition has 3-4-5 in the right hand and 1-2-3 in the left hand.

Measure 17 and 18 - The Zen-On edition has the left hand fingering of 3-1 -2-3-4-1. The W.B. edition has 2-1-2-3-1-2. Dr. Kataoka teaches 2-1-2-3-4-1.

Measure 20 and 21 - The Zen-On edition has 4-3-2-1 in the right hand and 1-3-2-1 in the left hand. The W.B. edition has 4-4-3-2 in the right hand and 1-2-1-3 in the left hand.

---

### ***Minuet 2***

by Johann Sebastian Bach

Measure 6 - The W.B. edition has the right hand fingering used by Dr. Kataoka. The fingering is 2-3-2-5. The Zen-On edition only indicates finger 2 on the first beat; therefore, a teacher may not know to also play the second beat with finger 3.

Measure 7 and 8 - The Zen-On edition fingering is 1-5-4-3-4-2 in the right hand and 5-2-1-4-3-2-4-3-2. The W.B. edition has 1-4-3-2-3-1 in the right hand and 5-1-2-5-3-2-4-3-2.

Measure 19 - The Zen-On edition has 4-(with an optional choice of 1 in parentheses)-2-1 in the left hand. The W.B. edition has 1-2-1 in the left hand. Dr. Kataoka teaches 4-2-1.

Measure 26 - The Zen-On edition has no fingering printed for the left hand. The W.B. edition fingering is 4-3-1. Dr. Kataoka teaches 3-2-1. Measure 29 and 30 - The Zen-On edition has 4-1-2-5-1-2 in the right hand. The W.B. edition has 5-1-2-5-1-2. Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingering.

**Additional comment:** The W.B. edition has footnotes. The first one states the repeated notes in the right hand of measure 2 should be played "as detached, repeated notes throughout the piece." Some teachers misunderstand this and teach students to play all repeated notes *staccato*. Dr. Kataoka teaches detached repeated notes in the right hand in measure 2, 4, 10, 12, 18, 20, 29, 30, 34, and 36. She does not teach repeated detached notes in the right hand of measure 5, 6, 25, 26, and 27.

---

### ***Minuet 3***

by Johann Sebastian Bach

Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingerings throughout.

Measure 1, beat 1 - The Zen-On edition has the fingering of this chord to be played with fingers 4-2-1. The W.B. edition has 5-3-1. The different fingerings of this chord affects measure 1-7.

Measure 1, beat 3 through measure 7 - The Zen-On edition's fingering for the left hand is 3-2-1-2-3-4-1-2-4. The W.B. edition fingering is 4-3-2-3-4-5-1-3-5.

Measure 23 and 24 - The Zen-On fingering is 4-1-2-3 for the right hand and 1-4-2-1 for the left hand. The W.B. edition fingering is 4-1-3-4 for the right hand and 1-5-3-1 for the left hand.

Measure 29, beat 1 - The Zen-On edition fingering is 4. The W.B. edition fingering is 5.

Measure 31 - The Zen-On edition has 3-5-1-3 in the right hand and 1-4-2 in the left hand. The W.B. edition has 3-5-1-4 in the right hand and 1-5-3 in the left hand.

**Additional comment:** Dr. Kataoka does not ask the students to hold the half notes found in measure 25 and 26 of the left hand for the same reason mentioned in *Minuet 1*.

---

***Minuet in G Minor***  
by Johann Sebastian Bach

Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingerings throughout.

Measure 13 - The Zen-On edition has the right hand fingering of 4-3-2-1-2. The W.B. edition has 5-4-3-2-1.

Measure 14 - The Zen-On edition has the right hand fingering of 5-3-2-1-2. The W.B. edition has 5-4-3-2-1.

Measure 16 - The Zen-On edition has the right hand fingering of 3. The W.B. edition has 2.

---

***Cradle Song***  
by Carl Maria von Weber

*Cradle Song* is a beautiful lullaby; therefore, the melody should be very smooth. Both editions have slurs one measure long, but the phrases are all four measures long. Throughout the entire four measures, the goal is to have a singing *legato* tone which is indicated by the tempo marking, *Andante cantabile*.

The right hand of measure 9-12 is the first difference between editions. W.B. has:

3	2	Nothing	3	Nothing	2	3	2	1	4	Nothing
<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>

The main point of these measures is to play beautiful *legato* repeated notes without stiffening the hand or playing monotonously. To keep the hand relaxed and change the tone of repeated notes, Dr. Kataoka asks students to change fingers as we have seen in the Bach *Minuets*. If questioned about an exact fingering for measures 9-12, I doubt that she would give us a definitive answer; however, she consistently seems to use the following:

3	2	2	3	2	2	2	2	1	4	3 (or 5)
<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>

or:

3	2	1	3	2	1	3	2	1	4	3
<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>

Like the right hand, the left hand should also be *legato* for each 4-measure phrase. In both editions, the left hand fingerings are the same except for the following:

In measure 7:

- W.B. has the 4th finger play the first half of the third beat (*Fa#*).
- Zen-On has this note played by the 3rd finger.
- Dr. Kataoka teaches the W.B. version.

In measure 8:

- W.B. has the chords (*Sol* and *Ti*) played by fingers 5 and 3. Zen-On has 4 and 2.

- Dr. Kataoka teaches the Zen-On version.

In measure 12:

- W.B. has 5 - 1 - (3) - (1) - (3) printed.
- Zen-On has 4 - (1) - (2) - (1) - (2).
- Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingering.

In the last measure, measure 16,

- W.B. prints the fingering of the chords (*Do* and *Mi*) as 5 and 3.
- Zen-On has them played with 4 and 2.
- Dr. Kataoka teaches the Zen-On version.

---

### *Minuet in F* by Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart

The phrases in the Mozart *Minuet* are four measures long. Keep strict time but allow phrase endings to *breathe* without rushing into the following phrases. Measure 20 is an exception to this because of the *fermata*. Like the Bach *Minuets* previously studied, the concept of light 3rd beats remains important. Dr. Kataoka is also very conscientious about observing rests and note values. This is especially true for the last measure of this piece. She is very particular about the last note sounding light and beautiful without changing the value of the quarter note. (The same is true of the last note of Mozart's K. 330, 1st movement.)

Zen-On indicates that all the eighth notes in this piece should be played as 2-note phrases. W.B. (Warner Brothers) has a dotted line slur (representing the editor's opinion) over the eighth notes and the first quarter note. A footnote also states the quarter notes are detached throughout the piece. The W.B. version is almost the same as the articulation Dr. Kataoka teaches.

Dr. Kataoka teaches that the eighth notes on the first beat are connected to the quarter note on the 2nd beat. The quarter notes on the 2nd and 3rd beats are rather *staccato* (like *Twinkle A* tone) and light. One exception to this articulation is in measure 7. She teaches the entire measure *legato* with a *staccato* (*Twinkle A* tone) 3rd beat. The left hand articulation is like *Cradle Song*. It is *legato* throughout each 4-measure phrase. She does not teach the *staccato* notes indicated in measure 4, 8, 12, 16, or 24 of the W.B. edition.

#### Right Hand Fingering:

- In measure 2, W.B. has finger 2 on the 3rd beat. Zen-On has nothing indicated. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 2.
- In measure 3, W.B. has the fingerings printed as 3 - 5 - 1 - 2; Zen-On has nothing except finger 3 on the 3rd beat; Dr. Kataoka teaches 3 - 5 - 1 - 3.
- In measure 5, W.B. has the fingering 1 - 3 - 5 - 4; Zen-On has 1 - 2 - 4 and nothing listed on the 3rd beat. Dr. Kataoka teaches 1 - 2 - 4 - 4.
- In measure 6, W.B. has 1 - 3 - 5 - 4 printed; Zen-On has 1 - 3 - 5 and nothing for the 3rd beat. Dr. Kataoka teaches 1 - 3 - 5 - 5.
- In measure 7, the first two beats outline a simple major-minor seventh chord. W.B. has the fingering listed as 1 - 2 - 4 - 5. This must be a misprint since the standard fingering for this chord



according to any scale manual is 1 - 2 - 3 - 5. Zen-On has no fingerings indicated for this measure. Dr. Kataoka teaches 1 - 2 - 3 - 5 - 4.

- In measure 9, the W.B. fingering is 3 - 5 - 1 - 2; Zen-On has 2 - (4) - 1 - 2. Dr. Kataoka teaches the Zen-On version.
- In measure 11, W.B. has 3 - 5 - 1 - 2, Zen-On only lists the 3rd finger on beat 3. Dr. Kataoka teaches 3 - 5 - 1 - 3.
- In measure 14, W.B. has 3 - (5) - 1 - 2; Zen-On only has finger 3 on the first note of the measure. Dr. Kataoka teaches 3 - 5 - 1 - 1.
- In measure 15, W.B. has 3 - 5 - 1 - 2; Zen-On has the 2nd finger on the first note of the measure and the 3rd finger on beat 3. Dr. Kataoka teaches 2 - 4 - 1 - 3.

### Left Hand Fingering:

- Measure 5, W.B. says finger 5; Zen-On has finger 2. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 2.
- Measure 6, W.B. says finger 5; Zen-On has finger 3. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 3.
- Measure 13, W.B. says finger 2; Zen-On has finger 1. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 1.
- Measure 14, W.B. says finger 1; Zen-On has finger 3. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 3.
- Measure 21, W.B. says finger 3; Zen-On has finger 1. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 1.

---

## *Arietta*

by Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart

Before discussing *Arietta*, it is important to consider the history of articulation markings and ornamentation in piano music during the Classical Era. Originally, articulation markings came from violin music and the slurs corresponded to violin bowings. For the pianist, these markings have to be taken "with a grain of salt". Sometimes they are to be followed strictly and other times, completely ignored. Ultimately, the pianist's ear is the only guide to forming an opinion. The same principle applies to ornamentation. Many historical treatises by composers like J.S. Bach, C.P.E. Bach, Francois Couperin, and others expounding the proper execution of ornaments have been written and remain in print. They all state different opinions. Each one states the rules according to the historical era and summarily instructs the reader to do whatever most pleases the ear. There really are no hard, fast rules about ornamentation. Also, from what is known about Mozart's personality and the improvisational performance style of that time, it is hard to imagine he would care whether his ornaments came on or off the beat.

### Right Hand Phrasing and Fingering:

The first point in *Arietta* concerns the slurs in measures 6 - 8 and 14 - 16. Both editions have the same slurs, one for each measure. Rather than break the *legato* at the end of measure 6, 7, and 8 as printed, Dr. Kataoka teaches one slur which spans across all three measures. The same articulation also applies to measure 14-16 and 38-39.

In measure 15, the W.B. edition indicates that the grace note comes with the left hand on the 2nd beat; however, Dr. Kataoka teaches it before the beat.

In measure 18, the W.B. edition has no slur but the Zen-On edition does. Dr. Kataoka teaches that there is a slur and it is carried across the bar line to the 1st beat of measure 19. The same is true in measure 22-23.

In measure 24, the W.B. edition has a 2-note slur from *Sol* to *La*. This makes the phrase sound as if it ends with the 3rd. beat of measure 24 and a new phrase begins in measure 25. In the Zen-On edition, there is no slur from *Sol* to *La* which makes the previous phrase end with *Sol*. The new phrase begins with *La* serving as a pick-up note to measure 25. Dr. Kataoka teaches the Zen-On version.

In measure 28, 29, and 30, the 2nd and 3rd beats have a slur written above them. Both editions are printed the same way. Dr. Kataoka again carries the slur across the bar line to the 1st beat in each case. In measure 30, the slur is further extended to include measure 31 to the new phrase beginning in measure 33.

In measure 28, the W.B. edition has finger 2 on *Do*. The Zen-On edition has finger 3. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 3. In measure 29, the Warner Brothers has finger one on *Ti* (flat). The Zen-On edition has finger 2. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 2.

In measure 30, the W.B. edition has finger 5 on *La* (2nd beat). The Zen-On edition has finger 4. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 4.

In measure 31, the W.B. edition has finger 4 on *Sol* and finger 1 on *Re*. The Zen-On edition has finger 3 on *Sol*, finger 1 on *Mi*, and finger 3 on *Re*. Dr. Kataoka teaches the fingering printed in the Zen-On edition.

In measure 32, the W.B. edition has finger 3 on *Do*. The Zen-On edition has finger 2. Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 2, followed by 4 on *Re* and *Do*.

### Left Hand Phrasing and Fingering:

In measure 1, the Zen-On edition has a slur over all 3 beats which might indicate *legato* repeated notes or an implied waltz accompaniment. The W.B. edition has a 2-note slur indicating a definite waltz-like effect. Dr. Kataoka teaches the 2-note slur, and the 2nd and 3rd. beats are played softly and *staccato*.

She also teaches that the dotted quarter notes in measure 1 - 3 are to be connected with each other to convey a counter-melody. Measures 5, 9 - 12, 13, 25-27, 33-35, and 37 are also played this way.

In measures 1 - 4, the fingering according to the W.B. edition is:

(Implied fingerings are in parentheses)

5	(1)	(1)	3	(1)	(1)	4	(1)	(1)	5	(1)	(1)
<i>Fa</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>

This fingering makes it impossible to create a *legato* counter-melody; therefore, Dr. Kataoka teaches the fingering found in the Zen-On edition which is:

4	(1)	(1)	2	(1)	(1)	3	(1)	(1)	5	(1)	(1)
<i>Fa</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Do</i>

In measure 7 and 8 of the Zen-On edition, both notes on the 1st beat are dotted quarter notes. In the Warner Brother Editions, only the upper note is a dotted quarter and the lower note is an eighth note. Dr. Kataoka teaches that both notes are dotted quarter notes.

In measure 4, 6, 7, 8, 12, 14, 28, 29, 30, and 38, the dotted quarter on the first beat is not connected to the first beat in the following measure.

All three beats in measure 15 and 39 are *staccato*.

---

***Melody***  
by Robert Schumann

The primary differences between the Japanese edition published by Zen-On and the American edition published by Warner Brothers for Robert Schumann's *Melody* are related to fingerings. The slurs and dynamics are the same in each edition, and the W.B. edition has the added bonus of clearly indicating with parentheses which markings were not originally Schumann's.

Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingerings throughout.

Right Hand Fingering:

Measure 3, 4th Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 1 on *Do*; Zen-On has Finger 2.

Measure 4, 1st Beat: Warner Bros. has Finger 4 on *Ti*; Zen-On has Finger 1.

Left Hand Fingering:

Measure 3, 4th Beat: Warner Bros. has Finger 3 on *Mi*; Zen-On has Finger 2.

Measure 4, 1st Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 4 on *Re*; Zen-On has Finger 3.

Measure 4, 2nd Beat: Warner Bros. has Finger 5 on *Do*; Zen-On has Finger 4.

Measure 6, 1st Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 4 on *Re*; Zen-On has Finger 3.

Measure 6, 2nd Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 5 on *Do*; Zen-On has Finger 4.

Measure 8, 2nd Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 5 on *Do* and Finger 4 on *Do#* (see note below); Zen-On has Finger 4 on *Do* and Finger 3 on *Do#*.

Measure 8, 3rd Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 3 on *Re*; Zen-On has Finger 2.

Measure 11, 1st Beat: Warner Bros. has Finger 3 on *Fa*; Zen-On has Finger 2.

Measure 11, 2nd Beat: Warner Bros. has Finger 5 on *Mi*; Zen-On has Finger 3.

Measure 11, 3rd Beat: Warner Bros has Finger 5 on *Re*; Zen-On has Finger 4.

Note: This series of articles uses the *Sol-Fa* system with a Fixed *Do* for naming notes. This means that in any key signature, "C" is always *Do*. *Sol-Fa* and *Solfège* are not the same systems; although, they are similar. Unlike *Solfège*, the addition of accidentals in the *Sol-Fa* system does not change the note's name. For example, when singing a note with an accidental, the pitch will change but the word "sharp" or "flat" would not be sung. However, when verbally discussing the names of notes, the word "sharp" or "flat" is used. Americans do not learn this system but many other countries do. It is very simple and children do not become confused.

---

## *Sonatina in G Major - Moderato*

by Ludwig van Beethoven

In the first movement of the Beethoven *Sonatina*, the major differences between the editions relate to phrasing and articulation. (The Warner Bros. edition will be referred to as W.B. for the sake of aligning the text.) The use of parentheses in the Warner Bros. edition is a useful tool for knowing what Beethoven really indicated in the score as opposed to what editors throughout the years have added. In this *Sonatina*, the melodic direction clearly indicates which dynamics to employ; therefore, comparisons between symbols for dynamics between the two editions need not be addressed.

Unless indicated otherwise, Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingering throughout.

### Right Hand Phrasing and Fingering, Measures 1-8:

*Zen-On:* There is one slur over all the notes from Measure 1, Beat 1 to Measure 2, Beat 1.

*W.B. :* The slur is written over Beats 3 and 4 only.

*Zen-On:* There is one slur over all the notes from Measure 3, Beat 1 to Measure 4, Beat 1. Also, the 4th finger plays the "Do" grace note preceding Measure 3, Beat 3.

*W.B. :* There is a slur over Measure 3, Beat 3 through 4 and no indication of the 4th finger on the grace note.

*Zen-On:* There is a slur from Measure 4, Beat 2 through Measure 5, Beat 1.

*W.B. :* There is a slur from Measure 4, Beat 2 through 4 only.

*Zen-On:* There is a slur from Measure 5, Beat 1 through Measure 6, Beat 1. A new slur begins on Measure 6, Beat 1 and continues through the 2nd eighth note of Measure 7, Beat 1. There are 2-note phrases on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th beats of Measure 7.

*W.B. :* The slur in Measure 5 is for Beat 3 - 4 only. The same type of slur is also used in Measure 6, Beat 3 - 4 only. Measure 7 has 2-note phrases on each beat.

Dr. Kataoka teaches a *legato* R.H. from Measure 5, Beat 1 through Measure 7, Beat 4. She does not teach the 2-note phrases as indicated in both editions in Measure 7.

*Zen-On:* Measure 8 consists of a 2-note phrase over the two cadential chords. The chord on the 1st beat is "Do" (finger 1)- Fa# (finger 3)- La (finger 5). The next chord is Ti (finger 1) and Sol (finger 4).

*W.B. :* Measure 8 also has a 2-note phrase but indicates "Do" and Fa# of the first chord may have been an editor's addition to Beethoven's authentic score. This is also indicated on the lower note (Ti) of the 2nd chord. Two possible fingerings are listed for Measure 8, Beat 3; however, the 4th finger must be used for the 3rd beat or it would not be possible to play a *legato* 2-note phrase.

### Left Hand Phrasing, Measures 1 - 8:

*Zen-On:* There is a slur from Measure 1, Beat 1 through Measure 2, Beat 1.

*W.B. :* No slur indicated.

*Zen-On:* There is a slur from Measure 3, Beat 1 to Measure 4, Beat 1.

*W.B. :* No slur.

*Zen-On:* There is a slur from Measure 5, Beat 1 through Measure 7, Beat 1.

*W.B. :* No slur.

*Zen-On*: All 4 quarter notes in Measure 7 have a *staccato* marking with a slur over the top which indicates non *legato* tone.

*W.B.* : All 4 quarter notes have an editorial marking for *staccato* and tenuto which is another way to express *non-legato*.

*Zen-On*: The notes in Measure 8 have a slur without *staccato* markings as in the previous measure.

*W.B.* : There is no slur.

#### Right Hand Phrasing and Fingering, Measures 9 - 17:

*Zen-On*: A slur begins at Measure 9, Beat 1 and continues to Measure 11, Beat 1. A new slur begins at Measure 11, Beat 1 and continues to Measure 13, Beat 1.

*W.B.* : A slur is over Measure 9, Beat 3-4 and Measure 11, Beat 3-4.

*Zen-On*: There are slurs from Measure 13, Beat 2 through Measure 14, Beat 1; from Measure 14, Beat 2 through Measure 15, Beat 1; from Measure 15, Beat 2 through Measure 16, Beat 1; and finally from Measure 16, Beat 2 through Measure 17, Beat 1. There is also a fingering discrepancy between the editions in Measure 15 and 16. *Zen-On*'s fingering is *Re* (1)- *Mi-Fa#-Sol* (1)-*La-Ti-Do* (4).

*W.B.* : The dotted slurs over notes are the editor's system for indicating Beethoven did not actually notate these slurs. The *W.B.* 's fingering is *Re* (1)-*Mi-Fa#-Sol-La* (1)-*Ti-Do* (4). In Measure 16, there are no slurs.

#### Left Hand Phrasing, Measures 9-17:

*Zen-On*: There is a slur from Measure 9, Beat 1 to Measure 10, Beat 1.

*W.B.* : No slur.

*Zen-On*: There is a slur from Measure 11, Beat 1 to Measure 12, Beat 1.

*W.B.* : No slur.

*Zen-On*: There are *staccato* markings for the chords on the 4th beat of Measure 13 and 14.

*W.B.* : The *staccato* marks are in parentheses indicating Beethoven did not actually write them.

#### Right Hand Phrasing and Fingering, Measures 25-34:

*Zen-On*: A slur begins at Measure 25, Beat 1 and continues to Measure 28, Beat 1. Measure 25, Beat 1 indicates finger 4 on *Re*.

*W.B.* : There is no slur in Measure 25 and finger 1 is indicated on *Re*. A slur begins in Measure 26, Beat 1 through Measure 26, Beat 4.

Dr. Kataoka teaches finger 4 on *Re* in Measure 25. Beats 3 and 4 are played detached. They are not played as *legato* repeated notes. The 3rd and 4th beats in Measure 27 are played the same way. She teaches *legato* tone from Measure 26, Beat 1 through Measure 27, Beat 1.

*Zen-On*: The slur begins in Measure 29, Beat 1 and continues to Measure 31, Beat 1.

*W.B.* : The slur does not begin until Measure 30, Beat 1 and continues to Measure 30, Beat 4.

Dr. Kataoka teaches Measure 29 like Measure 25; however, the fingering in Measure 29, Beat 1 is finger 1, not 4. The 3rd and 4th beats are played with finger 3 and 2 respectively. The *legato* begins at Measure 30, Beat 1 and continues to Measure 31, Beat 1. The quarter notes in Measure 31 are played

with Twinkle A tone. The chords in Measure 32 to the end of the first movement are played as *legato* repeated notes.

#### Left Hand Phrasing, Measures 25-34:

*Zen-On*: There is a slur from Measure 25, Beat 1 to Measure 32, Beat 1.

*W.B.* : There is one slur from Measure 25, Beat 1 through the 2nd eighth note of Beat 2 and again from Measure 25, Beat 3 through the 2nd eighth note of Beat 4.

The notes from Measure 32, Beat 3 to the end of the first movement are also *legato*, including *legato* repeated notes in Measure 32.

---

### ***Sonatina in G Major - Romance*** by Ludwig van Beethoven

The major differences between editions are the fingerings. The measure numbers in the Beethoven *Sonatina* run continuously through the first and second movements in the W.B. edition so that this movement runs from measure 35 to measure 74. Since this is not standard practice in music publishing, and since many teachers work from the earlier Summy Birchard edition or the Zen-On edition (or have re-numbered the measures in order to teach their students accepted practice), the measures will be cited as numbers 1-40 in this article.

Unless otherwise noted, Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingerings.

#### Right Hand Fingerings:

Measure 3, 6th Beat: *W.B.* : Finger 3; *Zen-On*: Finger 1.

Measure 4, 1st Beat: *W.B.* : Finger 4; *Zen-On*: Finger 2.

Dr. Kataoka teaches Finger 2. [If a student cannot reach the top note of the chords on Beat 2 and 3 without straining, follow the Right Hand of the W.B. fingering. Split the Left Hand chord by playing the top note ( *Re*) with the Right Hand thumb and the bottom note ( *Fa#*) with the Left Hand Finger.]

Measure 12, 3rd Beat: *W.B.* : Finger 4; *Zen-On*: Finger 3.

Measure 17, 4th Beat: *W.B.* : Finger 3; *Zen-On*: Finger 4.

Measure 21, 1st, 2nd, 3rd Beat: *W.B.* : Finger 1, 2, 3; *Zen-On*: Finger 4, 1, 2.

Measures 22-29: The fingerings are the same as Measures 1-8.

#### Left Hand Fingerings:

Measure 3: *W.B.* : Finger 5 on *Mi* and the chords are played with 3 and 1. *Zen-On*: Finger 4 on *Mi* and the chords are played with 2 and 1.

Measure 11: *W.B.* : The chord is played with 2 ( *La*) and 1 ( *Do#*).; *Zen-On*: Nothing indicated.

Dr. Kataoka teaches 3 on *La* and 2 on *Do#*. She teaches that the chords from Measure 9-12 are to be played *legato*. If a child's hand is too small to reach the octave in measure 12, the student only plays the lower note and the top note is dropped completely.

Measure 33: *W.B.* : Finger 3 (*Re*) and 1 (*Fa#*) and a slur begins on the 2nd chord in Measure 32 through the 1st chord of 33. *Zen-On*: No fingering indicated; however, there is a slur from Measure 32-33.

Dr. Kataoka teaches Finger 3 (*Re*) and 2 (*Fa#*) for the chord and the *legato* begins with the 1st chord in Measure 32 until the 1st chord of Measure 33.

Measure 35, Beat 1: *W.B.* : Finger 5; *Zen-On*: Finger 4.

---

### *Musette* by Johann Sebastian Bach

This *Musette* is from J.S. Bach's *English Suite, No. 3*. A parenthesis mark will be used to indicate an implied fingering when no actual finger number is printed in the book.

Dr. Kataoka uses all the fingerings in the *Zen-On* edition of this piece.

#### Right Hand Fingerings:

Measure 8, Beat 1: *W.B.* : Finger 5 (*La*) and 3 (*Fa#*); *Zen-On*: Finger 4 (*La*) and 2 (*Fa#*)

Measure 11:

<i>W.B.</i> :	(2)	1	2	3	4	(3)	(2)	1
	<i>La</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Fa#</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Fa#</i>	<i>Mi</i>
<i>Zen-On</i> :	(2)	1	3	4	5	4	3	2

Measure 12, Beat 1: *W.B.*: Finger 2 (*Re*); *Zen-On*: Finger 1 (*Re*)

Measure 15:

<i>W.B.</i> :	5	1	3	(1)	5	(2)	(3)	(1)
	<i>Re</i>	<i>Fa#</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Re</i>	<i>Ti</i>	<i>Fa#</i>	<i>Sol</i>	<i>Re</i>
<i>Zen-On</i> :	(5)	(2)	(3)	(1)	(5)	(2)	(3)	(1)

Measure 16: *W.B.*: Finger 4 (*Sol*) and 1 (*Re*); *Zen-On*: Finger 5 (*Sol*) and 2 (*Re*)

#### Left Hand Fingerings:

Measure 2, Beat 2:

<i>W.B.</i> :	3	(4)
	<i>Ti</i>	<i>La</i>
<i>Zen-On</i> :	(2)	(3)

Measure 3:

<i>W.B.</i> :	(3)	1	2	(3)
	<i>Ti</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Ti</i>	<i>La</i>
<i>Zen-On</i> :	(2)	(1)	(2)	(3)

Measure 6:

<i>W.B.</i> :	3	(4)	(3)	2	(3)
---------------	---	-----	-----	---	-----

	<i>Ti</i>	<i>La</i>	<i>Ti</i>	<i>Do</i>	<i>Ti</i>
<i>Zen-On:</i>	(2)	(3)	(2)	(1)	(2)

Measure 7, Beat 2 (last half):

*W.B.:* 2 (*Do*), then 4 (*La*)

*Zen-On:* 1 (*Do*), then 3 (*La*)

Measure 8, Beat 1:

*W.B.:* Finger 2 (*Do*) and finger 5 is continues to hold the tied note (*Sol*)

*Zen-On:* Finger 1 (*Do*) and finger 5 continues to hold the tied note (*Sol*)

---

### ***Minuet in G Minor***

by Johann Sebastian Bach

The fingerings and articulations between the Zen-On edition and the W.B. edition are not too different from each other. The main difference is that the W.B. edition encourages the use of ornamentation; although, it does mention the ornaments are optional. No ornaments are printed in the *Zen-On* edition of this piece, and Dr. Kataoka does not teach them.

Unless otherwise indicated, Dr. Kataoka uses the Zen-On fingerings.

#### Right Hand Fingerings:

Measure 15, Beat 3: *W.B.:* Finger 1; *Zen-On:* Finger 3

Measure 25, Beat 2: *W.B.:* Finger 5; *Zen-On:* Nothing indicated.

Measure 26, Beat 2: *W.B.:* Finger 1 on *Fa#* and Finger 5 on *Do*; *Zen-On:* Finger 2 on *Fa#* and Finger 4 on *Do*.

#### Left Hand Fingerings:

Measure 14, Beats 2 and 3: *W.B.:* Finger 3 on *La*, Finger 5 on *Fa*; *Zen-On:* Finger 2 on *La*, Finger 4 on *Fa*.

Measure 28, Beat 1: *W.B.:* Finger 1; *Zen-On:* Finger 2.

---

Return to Suzuki Piano Basics Foundation Home Page,  
<http://core.ecu.edu/hist/wilburnk/SuzukiPianoBasics/>.

Please send corrections to [Kenneth Wilburn](#), Web Editor

First Online Edition: 24 May 2003

Last Revised: 31 July 2003